



Osteopathic Medical Board of California

AMENDED Board Meeting Minutes

November 13, 2025

**MEMBERS
PRESENT:**

Denise Pines, MBA, President
Hemesh Patel, D.O., Vice President
Gor Adamyan, Secretary
John M. Cummins, J.D.
Brett Lockman, D.O.
Matthew Swain, D.O.

**STAFF
PRESENT:**

Erika Calderon, Executive Director
Machiko Chong, Licensing Program Manager
Cristy Livramento, Enforcement Program Manager
Terri Thorfinnson, Legislative/Regulatory Specialist
Shelly Jones, Asst. Deputy Director, DCA
Kaila Van Lint, Budget Analyst, DCA
Suzanne Balkis, Budget Manager, DCA
Marcy Larson, Administrative Law Judge, OAH
Matthew Fleming, Deputy Attorney General
Beth Clark, Associate Governmental Program Analyst
Ralph Correa, Probation Monitor
Yuping Lin, Board Counsel
Kristy Schieldge, Regulations Counsel

**MEMBERS OF
THE AUDIENCE:**

Holly Macriss, Executive Director, OPSC
Michelle Monserratt-Ramos, Consumer Watchdog
Maria Ibarra-Navarrette, Consumer Watchdog
Kimberly Turbin, Consumer Watchdog
Tracy Dominguez, Consumer Watchdog

Board Meeting Minutes – November 13, 2025

Agenda Item 1 Call to Order/Roll Call/Establishment of a Quorum

The Quarterly Board Meeting of the Osteopathic Medical Board of California (OMBC) was called to order by President Denise Pines at 9:00 a.m.

Machiko Chong called roll and determined a quorum was present. The meeting was held at the Department of Consumer Affairs, Hearing Room HQ1, in Sacramento, CA.

Agenda Item 2 Reading of the Board's Mission Statement

Executive Director Erika Calderon read the Board's mission statement: "to protect the public by requiring competency, accountability, and integrity in the safe practice of medicine by osteopathic physicians and surgeons"

Agenda Item 3 Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda

President Pines opened the floor for public comments.

The WebEx moderator checked for online requests; no public comments were made for items not on the agenda.

Agenda Item 4 Review and Possible Approval of Board Meeting Minute

Beth Clark presented the minutes from the August 14, 2025, Board Meeting.

Public Comment: Holly Macriss (OPSC) requested a correction on page 11 to clarify that she stated she would be updating the Board on the upcoming osteopath bill, rather than requesting updates from the Board.

Motion to adopt the August 14, 2025, minutes as amended.

Motion – Dr. Patel Second – Mr. Cummins

- **Aye** – Adamyan, Cummins, Lockman, Patel, Pines, Swain
- **Nay** – None
- **Abstention** – None
- **Absent** – Negeen Mirreghabie

Motion carried to approve the minutes as amended.

Board Meeting Minutes – November 13, 2025

Agenda Item 5: Hearing on Petition for Early Termination of Probation

Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) Marcy Lawson presided over the hearing for Eman Abdallah, D.O.

Deputy Attorney General Matthew Fleming represented the People. Dr. Abdallah represented herself and was sworn in.

Deputy AG Fleming provided a history of the case, noting Dr. Abdallah's license was placed on five years of probation in June 2023 for gross negligence and aiding unlicensed practice at med spas.

Dr. Abdallah testified regarding her rehabilitation, her current ownership of a private practice where she performs all medical treatments herself, and her improved record-keeping systems. Deputy AG Fleming recommended the Board continue the probation, noting it was the earliest possible time for a petition and that the public interest is best served by allowing the term to play out. The Board took the matter under submission for deliberation in closed session.

Agenda Item 6: President's Report

President Denise Pines reported on:

- **Personnel Changes:** Recognition of Andrew Moreno for seven years of service; welcome to new member Negeen Mirreghabie (spectator online, joining in person in January).
- **Events:** Announcement of "Hill Day" on January 21, 2026, to meet with legislators.
- **International/National:** Updates on the Federation of State Medical Boards (FSMB) meeting in Dublin regarding medical racism standards and the emerging licensing pathway for "assistant physicians".
- **DCA Leadership:** Acknowledgment of DCA Director Kimberly Kirchmeyer's upcoming retirement.
- **Public Comment:** Representatives from Consumer Watchdog criticized the use of clinical terminology such as "cradle to the grave" and requested that enforcement committee meetings be held in public.

Agenda Item 7: Board Member Communications with Interested Parties

President Pines requested disclosures. No board members reported communications.

Board Meeting Minutes – November 13, 2025

Agenda Item 8: Intergovernmental Relations Reports and Administrative Services Update

- **DCA Update:** Shelly Jones reported on the appointment of Lucy Saldivar as Deputy Director of Board and Bureau Relations and provided updates on mandatory training (Sexual Harassment Prevention and Unconscious Bias).
- **Budget Update:** Kaila Van Lindt reported the Board ended FY 24/25 with approximately 12.4 months in reserve. However, future expenditures are projected to increase by 3% annually while revenues remain static.

Agenda Item 9: Executive Director's Report

Erika Calderon introduced new staff members Rachel Molina (Enforcement Analyst) and Yvonne Almazan (Special Investigator).

She noted that enforcement staff have returned to the office three days per week for onboarding and collaboration.

Agenda Item 10: Licensing/Admin Program Summary

Machiko Chong reported a total population of 17,012 licensed D.O.s. Total applications are up 17% overall.

Revisions were made to FNP applications to clarify requirements for various filing types.

Agenda Item 11: Enforcement Program Summary

Cristy Livramento reported 320 complaints received this quarter, a 33% increase from the previous year.

Referred cases to the AG doubled compared to the same quarter last year.

Public Comment: Consumer Watchdog volunteers shared personal stories regarding the impact of physician negligence and requested transparency in case management.

Agenda Item 12: Probation Program Summary

Ralph Correa reported 31 active probationers.

Board Meeting Minutes – November 13, 2025

He detailed field monitoring efforts, including unannounced visits to ensure compliance with cease practice orders.

Agenda Item 13: Rulemaking Update

Terri Thorfinnson confirmed that the prior regulatory package became effective October 1, 2025.

The Fee and License Status package and Disciplinary Guidelines are currently in progress

Agenda Item 14: Discussion and Possible Action to Consider Initiation of a Rulemaking to Amend Sections 1630, 1636, 1646, 1647, 1656, 1658, and 1690, and to Adopt Section 1648 in Division 16 of Title 16 of the California Code of Regulations (CCR) (Retired License, Petitions and Fees)

Terri Thorfinnson presented an overview of the proposed regulatory changes, which are set forth in the meeting materials. For this package, the Board reviewed a trimmed down version of a prior approved rulemaking package from August of 2025. The focus of this rulemaking is solely fee increases, specifically to raise fees to the statutory maximums authorized by law, set a retired license status, and set petition fees to include adjudication fees previously not considered by the Board.

Board staff noted that in the prior version adopted by the Board in August of 2025, staff was overly ambitious and diverted the attention from the fees and priority of the increase of these fees to also focus on making some amendments to application language. However, it was noted that further changes in the application language were needed after the compilation of the package. The Board's Executive Director did not want further delays to this critical fee rulemaking and recommended removing amendments that did not otherwise relate to fee increases or address the Board's long-standing goal of establishing a retired license and establish its petition fees, so it was decided to present the Board with this trimmed down version; application amendments will be addressed in a separate package at a later time. This proposed language is the result of that recommendation.

Action Requested: The Board should review the proposed regulatory text and the attachments and consider whether they would support the proposed text as written or if there are suggested changes to the proposed text. After review, the staff requested that the Board consider one of the motions as set forth in the meeting materials.

Ms. Thorfinnson presented the key details of the proposed amendments as set forth in the meeting materials in her memorandum to the Board.

Board Discussion: Dr. Lockman raised concerns about CME and the lack of available AOA category 1A CME specific to specialties. Regulations Counsel clarified that the Board is not addressing CME with this regulatory package and suggested that Dr. Lockman raise the concern regarding dedicated CME and Category 1A CME issues for a possible future meeting and agenda item.

Board Meeting Minutes – November 13, 2025

Dr. Lockman raised concerns about financial hardship for petitioners. Counsel Schieldge explained that under this proposal, petition fees would shift the cost burden from the general licensee population (since all costs by the Board are currently paid out of one Fund) to the individual requesting to petition the Board. Furthermore, the Board supported the legislation to recover costs for petitions, so staff are simply trying to implement the policy supported by the Board.

Dr. Lockman raised additional concerns stating that Board staff is arguing that the collection of the adjudication fees will prevent the Board from requesting a fee increase however the Board is already seeking a fee increase to get its fees statutorily capped out, but the Board may also need an additional statutory fee increase down the road. The question was raised as to when we will know how to stop asking for increases.

Counsel Schieldge indicated that the Board has never requested petition fees so the Board's staff are unable to determine where the Board's budget will be if it starts collecting those petition fees. What the Board knows now is that the Board is spending more than the Board is bringing in and the Board currently has a structural imbalance. The goal of this proposal is to raise all fees to current statutory caps to see if further fee increases are necessary. Executive Director Calderon also noted that the Board has not raised fees since 1994 and that the Board is projected to be in deficit (one month in reserve) in 2027. Ms. Thorfinnson stressed that the Board needs to raise fees under its current authority first before asking for any further legislative assistance to correct any continuing structural imbalance.

Mr. Cummins asked a clarifying question about the adjudication fee. He asked if the petition costs are more than \$20,000.00 what happens. Ms. Thorfinnson responded by saying that the Board would absorb the costs. Counsel Schieldge further explained that the Board could reevaluate this cost at a later time after obtaining data showing the need for an increase, and consider doing another rulemaking to raise the fee.

Motion – Dr. Swain Second – Mr. Cummins to:

Approve the proposed regulatory text in Attachments 1-5 including the adoption and repeal of the forms incorporated by reference in Attachments 2-5 and to submit the text to the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs and the Business, Consumer Services, and Housing Agency for review and if no adverse comments are received, authorize the Executive Director to take all steps necessary to initiate the rulemaking process, make any non-substantive changes to the text and the package and set the matter for a hearing if requested. If after the 45-day public comment period, no adverse comments are received, and no public hearing is requested, authorize the Executive Director to take all steps necessary to complete the rulemaking, and adopt the proposed regulations as noticed for 16 CCR sections 1630, 1636, 1646, 1647, 1648, 1656, 1658, and 1690.

Public comments were received from Holly Macriss, Executive Director for the Osteopathic Physicians and Surgeons of California. Ms. Macriss indicated that they had several comments about the proposed regulatory language, which she said would be submitted on behalf of her organization during the 45-day public comment period.

She also requested clarification on the differences between the workload tables listed in Attachment 6 relating to the costs for petitions for penalty relief (Attachment 6 items entitled (G) "Petitions for Modification of Penalty (Application Processing Fee)"; and (H) "Petition for Penalty Relief Costs (Fee to Adjudicate Petition)"). Regulations Counsel Schieldge explained that the first workload tables in Attachment 6 relate to the workload costs to the Board for processing the applications for either a petition for modification of penalty or a petition for

Board Meeting Minutes – November 13, 2025

reinstatement (which costs are higher due to the workload involved) to determine whether they qualify to petition and have submitted a completed application. The second table entitled “Petition for Penalty Relief Costs” relate to the costs to the Board for adjudicating the petition once the application is approved, including holding a hearing and formulating a decision.

President Pines called for the vote on the motion. Machiko Chong, Licensing Program Manager, took a roll call vote on the motion, as follows:

- **Aye** – Mr. Adamyan, Mr. Cummins, Dr. Lockman, Dr. Patel, Ms. Pines, Dr. Swain
- **Nay** – None
- **Abstention** – None
- **Absent** – Negeen Mirreghabie

Motion carried.

Agenda Item 15: Discussion on Legislation

Terri Thorfinnson reviewed the status of several bills:

- **AB 489** (AI Deception) was signed into law.
- **AB 460** (Radiologist Telemedicine) was signed into law.
- **AB 432** (Menopause CME) and **AB 742** (Expedited Licensure) were vetoed by the Governor.

Agenda Item 16: Future Agenda Items and Meeting Dates

The Board requested a future presentation on the administrative law process and a panel discussion on CME requirements.

The next meeting is scheduled for January 22, 2026.

Agenda Item 17: Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned by President Denise Pines.